

The CITY OF DAYTONA BEACH

"THE WORLD'S MOST FAMOUS BEACH"

MEMORANDUM

To:

James V. Chisholm, City Manager

From:

James Morris, Deputy City Manager/Administrative Services

Date:

October 25, 2017

Re:

First Step Shelter

At the direction of the City Commission, the firm of Bentley Architects was retained by the City to evaluate two architectural designs for the First Step Shelter. The designs are characterized herein as the "Chapin-tensile fabric roof design" and the "Hall and Ogle traditional roof design." Besides the roof types, other significant characteristics of the proposals distinguish the designs from one another that will impact both time and cost of the project.

As originally presented, the Chapin design intended a temporary structure that would utilize a concrete slab over a subterranean stormwater structure with placement of temporary or portable structures affixed to the slab to create dormitories. The male and female dormitories would be separated by a common area, semi-open air plaza that would be sheltered by a tensile fabric roof. The Hall and Ogle design utilizes permanent, traditional construction, either masonry block constructed by masons or potentially tilt up wall construction, to create the dormitory facilities with a semi-open air plaza sheltered by a traditional roof structure over the common area that would separate the dormitories. The specifics of the details of each architectural design as reviewed by Bentley architects are included in the Agenda Packet.

The materials available to staff from each architect was transmitted with a cover letter to Bentley architects. Your review of the transmittal letter will show that particular criteria for evaluation of the designs were listed. The contact information for each submitting architectural firm was provided to Bentley. The purpose of providing the contact information for each architectural designer was to allow the reviewing architects to contact each of the submitting architects and allow them to provide commentary, insight and guidance on their particular design to the reviewing architect. This step was taken to allow each design professional to specifically address the reviewing architects and communicate their thoughts on their own design. This step also assures everyone, including the submitting architects, that the review of the two designs has been objective and fair without coloration of the review by communication or transmission of information from City Staff. It is my understanding that Bentley architects contacted both Mr. Chapin and Hall and Ogle. Additionally Mr. Chapin delivered more materials to Bentley in Orlando prior to their rendition of the opinion which is attached hereto.

Consistent with the directions to City Staff, Bentley architects were directed to transmit a final report to the Mayor in care of the City Manager. The final report and conclusion stated therein were not reviewed or approved by staff in advance of its transmission to the City. The letter requesting direct transmission of the report to the Mayor is attached hereto as an exhibit on page 2.

The St. John's permit for clearing the First Step site has been issued. Upon the Commission's selection of the architectural firm and their design for the First Step Shelter, staff will take every step possible to promptly advance the design to construction. An additional point of information has become available since the beginning of the debate pertaining to the two designs. The geotechnical report on the site establishes that the soils on the site will not require the "overburden compaction" method once suggested by Mr. Chapin as a necessity for traditional construction to occur on the site. Use of the traditional site compaction with tractors and water will significantly reduce the time needed to prepare the site for construction (in comparison to the overburden method suggested by Mr. Chapin). In the course of oral discussion before the Commission, Mr. Chapin indicated that his design could be modified to eliminate storm water retention beneath the slab and place it away from the building as was originally proposed in the Hall and Ogle design. Also in his discussion, Mr. Chapin referenced that the fabric roof could be sufficiently strengthened to withstand hurricane strength winds. Mr. Chapin also stated that the portable dormitory structures could be hardened sufficiently to serve as hurricane shelters. These concepts were not presented by Mr. Chapin at the onset of the debate as to which design should be relied upon by the Commission. As a result, the additional expense of accomplishing the steps is not known. From inception, Hall and Ogle design anticipated use of the First Step structure to also serve as a hurricane shelter. Accordingly, the Hall and Ogle estimates do anticipate the cost of constructing a structure able to withstand hurricane winds and debris structures.

Recommended Action: Selection of Mr. Chapin or Hall & Ogle to prepare plans to construct the First Step Shelter.